

# Washington University Global Studies Law Review

---

---

VOLUME 3

SPECIAL ISSUE

2004

---

---

## JUDICIAL ACTIVISM IN A VIOLENT CONTEXT:

### THE ORIGIN, ROLE, AND IMPACT OF THE COLOMBIAN CONSTITUTIONAL COURT\*

JUSTICE MANUEL JOSÉ CEPEDA-ESPINOSA

SPONSORED BY THE WHITNEY R. HARRIS  
INSTITUTE FOR GLOBAL LEGAL STUDIES

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. THE MAKING OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT .....	537
A. <i>The Constitutional System of Judicial Review in the 1886         Constitution</i> .....	537
1. <i>The Origins and Features of the 1886 Scheme</i> .....	538
2. <i>Advantages and Disadvantages of the System</i> .....	540
3. <i>The Prevailing Interpretative Approach and the             Erosion of the Supreme Court's Legitimacy</i> .....	543
B. <i>The 1991 Modification of Constitutional Judicial Review</i> .....	545
1. <i>The Debate Over the Creation of the Constitutional             Court Within the Constituent Assembly</i> .....	547
2. <i>A New System of Constitutional Judicial Review for a             New Constitution</i> .....	552
a. <i>Acción de Tutela and Concrete Review</i> .....	552
b. <i>The Expansion of Automatic (Ex-officio) Abstract                 Review</i> .....	554

---

\* I am very grateful to Federico Guzmán for his contribution to the preparation of this paper.

c.	<i>The Broadening of Actio Popularis to Trigger Abstract Judicial Review</i> .....	555
d.	<i>The Means to Contextualize Abstract Review</i> .....	556
II.	THE ROLE OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT: “ADJUDICATING” AT THE “CENTER OF THE STORM” .....	557
A.	<i>The Jurisdiction and Work of the Court</i> .....	557
1.	<i>A Quantitative Overview</i> .....	559
2.	<i>Basic Types of Decisions and Their Effects</i> .....	564
a.	<i>Decisions Adopted in Abstract Review</i> .....	565
i.	.....	566
ii.	.....	569
b.	<i>Decisions Adopted in Concrete Review</i> .....	571
B.	<i>The Court’s Main Decisions and Case-Law Tendencies</i> .....	575
1.	<i>Decisions Concerning Rights</i> .....	575
a.	<i>Basic Liberties</i> .....	578
i.	<i>Personal Autonomy</i> .....	578
(a)	<i>Personal Drug Consumption</i> .....	579
(b)	<i>Euthanasia</i> .....	580
(c)	<i>Mandatory Use of Safety Belts</i> .....	581
(d)	<i>Personal Appearance</i> .....	582
(e)	<i>Freedom to Determine One’s Gender</i> .....	584
(f)	<i>Abortion</i> .....	585
ii.	<i>Freedom and Equality of Religions</i> .....	588
(a)	<i>The Concordat Case</i> .....	589
(b)	<i>The Sacred Heart Case</i> .....	590
(c)	<i>The Religious Freedom Statutory Law Case</i> ....	590
(d)	<i>Protection of Minorities Cases</i> .....	591
iii.	<i>Freedom of the Press</i> .....	592
(a)	<i>Freedom of the Press in Conflict with Privacy</i> .....	592
(b)	<i>Dissemination of Classified Information and Personal Reputation Issues</i> .....	594
(c)	<i>Journalists’ Licensing</i> .....	595
(d)	<i>Covert Retaliation Against Criticism</i> .....	596
(e)	<i>Freedom of the Press and Public Order</i> .....	597
iv.	<i>Freedom of Expression</i> .....	598
b.	<i>Equality</i> .....	599
i.	<i>Gender</i> .....	600
ii.	<i>Sexual Orientation</i> .....	604
iii.	<i>Persons with Disabilities</i> .....	607
iv.	<i>Extreme Poverty</i> .....	611

v. <i>Race</i> .....	615
c. <i>Social and Economic Rights</i> .....	616
d. <i>Collective Rights</i> .....	620
i. <i>Indigenous Peoples</i> .....	622
ii. <i>Environmental Rights</i> .....	626
2. <i>Decisions Concerning the State</i> .....	631
a. <i>States of Exception</i> .....	631
b. <i>Congressional Autonomy</i> .....	635
c. <i>Presidential Authority in Matters of Public Order</i> <i>During Ordinary Times</i> .....	637
3. <i>Decisions Concerning the Economy</i> .....	641
a. <i>Tutela Decisions with Public Costs</i> .....	642
b. <i>The “UPAC” System for Financing Housing</i> <i>Alternatives</i> .....	643
c. <i>Annual Salary Increases</i> .....	645
4. <i>Decisions Concerning Private Powers</i> .....	646
III. THE IMPACT OF THE COURT .....	649
A. <i>The Court’s Impact in the Legal Field</i> .....	650
1. <i>Change in the Prevailing Interpretative Approach</i> .....	650
2. <i>Applying the Constitution to All Branches of the Law</i> ....	655
3. <i>The Importance of New Concepts and the</i> <i>Incorporation of Current Constitutional Issues into</i> <i>National Case Law</i> .....	659
4. <i>The Rise of an Equity Jurisdiction</i> .....	661
5. <i>The Pressure for Further Change in the Legal System</i> ...	662
B. <i>The Impact in the Political Domain</i> .....	663
1. <i>No Longer a Paper Constitution</i> .....	665
2. <i>An Instrument to Seek the Redistribution of Political</i> <i>and Social Power</i> .....	665
3. <i>A Legitimate Arbiter Facing Enduring Criticism</i> .....	665
4. <i>A Forum to Make Difficult Decisions</i> .....	666
5. <i>A Second Round for Everything</i> .....	666
6. <i>A Controversial Institutional Actor</i> .....	667
7. <i>The Wider Context: Constitutionalism Against</i> <i>Violence</i> .....	667
IV. GUARDING THE GUARDIANS: JUDICIAL ACTIVISM AND THE SPECIFICS OF THE COLOMBIAN CONTEXT .....	668
A. <i>Checks over the Court’s Powers</i> .....	669
1. <i>External Checks and Balances</i> .....	669
a. <i>Checks by Congress</i> .....	671
b. <i>Control by the People</i> .....	673

2.	<i>Self-Restraint Mechanisms</i> .....	674
a.	<i>The First Limitation of Power</i> .....	675
b.	<i>Second Limitation of Power</i> .....	676
B.	<i>The Political and Institutional Specificities of the Colombian Context</i> .....	680
1.	<i>Political Specificities: Presidentialism, Low Credibility of Congress and Political Parties, and Violence</i> .....	680
2.	<i>Institutional Specificities: Constitutional Amendment, Election of Justices, Fixed Term for Justices, and Access to Judicial Procedures</i> .....	682
C.	<i>A Response to the Objections to the Court's Powers</i> .....	684
V.	A CRITICAL APPRAISAL: FLAWS AND ASPECTS OF THE COURT'S WORK THAT REQUIRE IMPROVEMENT .....	687